A guide to everyday questions about language

Donna Jo Napoli Vera Lee-Schoenfeld

UNIVERSITY PRESS

2010

OXFORD

Oxford New York

Auckland Bangkok Buenos Aires Cape Town Chennai Dar es Salaam Delhi Hong Kong Istanbul Karachi Kolkata Kuala Lumpur Madrid Melbourne Mexico City Mumbai Nairobi São Paulo Shanghai Taipei Tokyo Toronto

Copyright © 2010 by Oxford University Press, Inc.

Published by Oxford University Press, Inc. 198 Madison Avenue, New York, New York 10016

www.oup.com

Oxford is a registered trademark of Oxford University Press
All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced,
stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means,
electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise,
without the prior permission of Oxford University Press.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Napoli, Donna Jo, 1948—
Language matters: a guide to everyday questions about language /
Donna Jo Napoli & Vera Lee-Schoenfeld. — 2nd ed.
p. cm.
Includes index.
ISBN 978-0-19-973571-6

1. Language and languages—Miscellanea. I. Lee-Schoenfeld, Vera.
II. Title.
P107.N37 2010
400—dc22 2009028147

The illustrations appearing on page 163 are from *The World's Writing Systems*, edited by Peter T. Daniels and William Bright. Copyright 1996 by Oxford University Press, Inc. Used by permission.

Printed in the United States of America on acid-free paper

Preface

This book has two authors, one who's been teaching linguistics since 1973, and another who's been teaching languages and linguistics since 1998. Journalists, friends, and people we just happen to have conversations with approach us in that role with questions—ranging all over the board—that often reveal misconceptions about language. We use language in most of our daily interactions with other people, so the types of questions that can arise are at least as varied as the types of situations in which we use language. Here are some examples:

How can we stop our children from using bad grammar? Why don't we reform English spelling so that the words will be spelled exactly as we all say them? Why are some languages so much harder to speak than others?

The first question is problematic because the whole notion of good versus bad grammar is problematic. How do we decide whose grammar is good and whose is not? Language changes from one generation to the next, no matter what, and change is simply that—neither improvement nor deterioration; it is merely change. The second question is based on the assumption that we all pronounce words in the same way. Even within the United States that is false, but certainly, when we look at Canada, England, India,

vii

Australia, Nigeria, and other countries where English is one of the national languages, the falsity of that assumption is obvious. The third question is based on another false assumption. So far as we know, hearing children around the world acquire the spoken language of the people around them with equal ease, and deaf children around the world who are exposed to a sign language acquire that sign language with equal ease. Therefore, it may not make sense to think about languages as being inherently difficult or not. (We qualify our conclusion with "may not" rather than "does not" because we have a colleague who works on Navajo, and the intricacies of that language make us wonder whether perhaps linguists are blithely leaving out Navajo when they arrive at such conclusions.) It might well be true, on the other hand, that it is harder for a speaker of a particular language X than for a speaker of a particular language Y to learn a particular language Z in adulthood. We carry the information we know about language from one language to the next as we learn new languages, and that may well affect the ease with which we learn the next language. Nevertheless, we don't know of any particular language K, for example, that stands out as being more difficult for speakers of all other languages to learn in adulthood.

When we respond to questions about language, sometimes our knowledge of particular languages and of the formal nature of linguistic principles helps us. This is particularly true if the questions are about how language is produced and processed or about particular sociolinguistic facts, such as differences between regional speech patterns. But we are struck by how often these questions could have been answered by anybody who took the time to seriously consider language use. Ordinary speakers have a great deal of knowledge about language, and if they apply common sense in analyzing language, they can debunk many common misconceptions.

Most people, however, have little idea of how to approach language questions. If you want to learn about language in a formal way, we encourage you to pick up a linguistics textbook or to take a linguistics course. However, if you want to learn how to look at language issues so that you can make sensible and responsible decisions about language in your daily life, then this book will help you.

Although there are two authors of this book, we divided up the work, with one of us taking the lead on each chapter. So the chapters use an I that is sometimes one of us and sometimes the other.

The chapters in this book are divided into two parts. Part I deals with language as a human ability. Part II deals with language in the context of society. At the end of each chapter is a list of readings for further consultation, as well as keywords for an Internet (e.g., Google) search. Another wonderful resource is the website of videos on language set up by the Linguistic Society of America: http://www.uga.edu/lsava/Archive.html.

The chapters invite you into one way of approaching language. They help you to uncover assumptions behind language questions so that you can evaluate them. They help you to recognize what sorts of things might be evidence for or against different positions on a language issue. And they help sort out the evidence in a systematic and methodologically sound way. Although only fifteen issues are addressed in this book, we hope that reading these chapters will give you the confidence to approach other language issues in a systematic way.

Linguistics is a field in which reasonable people can and do disagree. Nevertheless, in this book we are rarely equivocal (we are linguists, not politicians). However, the arguments are laid out step by step, so if you disagree at any point along the way, you can diverge and find your own answers, knowing, at least, what our position is and why.

Contents

1311 Language: The Human Ability

- 1 How do we acquire language? 3
- 2 What is linguistics? 21
- 3 From one language to the next: Why is it hard to learn a second language? Why is translation so difficult? 32
- 4 Does language equal thought? 50
- 5 Are sign languages real languages? 63
- 6 Do animals have language? 75
- 7 Can computers learn language? 91

MAPLINguage in Society

- 8 Can one person's speech be better than another's? 105
- 9 Why do dialects and creoles differ from standard language? 125
- 10 Do men and women talk differently? And who cares? 139
- 11 English spelling is hard, and it makes learning to read hard. Should we do anything about it? 151
- 12 Should the United States adopt English as the official language and overhaul the educational system accordingly? 168

- 13 How does language wield power over us? Can it overpower us? 190
- 14 Does exposure to and use of offensive language harm children? 200
- 15 What do we lose when a language dies? And who cares? 215 Index 229

Den Mility
The Human Ability